Risk & Rigor

A Lawyer's Guide to Decision Trees for Assessing Cases and Advising Clients
About the Author

Marjorie Corman Aaron is a Professor of Practice and Director of the Center for Practice at the University of Cincinnati College of Law where she teaches negotiation, client counseling, mediation, trial practice, and decision analysis. Professor Aaron has designed and taught workshops on these topics for law firms, law departments, federal court judges, magistrates, and mediator panelists, and other organizations in the U.S. and internationally. She is an active mediator, arbitrator, and dispute resolution consultant, and has used decision tree analysis in her practice for more than thirty years.

Professor Aaron was formerly Executive Director of the Program on Negotiation at Harvard Law School, and a Vice President and mediator at Endispute, Inc. (now JAMS). A graduate of Princeton University and Harvard Law School, she first practiced as a litigator in Massachusetts at Goodwin Proctor and as an assistant district attorney.

Professor Aaron is also the author of Client Science: Advice for Lawyers on Counseling Clients Through Bad News and Other Legal Realities (Oxford University Press, 2012) and has published many articles, chapters, and simulations, and videos in her field.
To my husband David, and our sons Joshua and Elisha, for the honor and joy of making decisions and taking chances with you.

Marjorie Corman Aaron

March 2019
# Table of Contents

**Background and Acknowledgments** .......................................................... XIII

**Author’s Note regarding Complex Tree Images, Video Links, and Website** ........ XVII

**Introduction - Forswearing Ambiguity of Purpose or Method** ...................... 1

**Chapter One - Deciding with Clarity Before Climbing Trees** ...................... 5
  - Decision Analysis - Definitions and Distinctions with Trees and Risk .......... 5
  - The Perils of Lawyering in Prose Alone ............................................. 6
  - Mortal Mind as Measure of Tree-Worthy Complexity ............................. 8

**Chapter Two - Logical Premises - Fiction, Meaning, Method, Practice** ........ 11
  - Situated in Fiction, But Not Alone in Our Imaginary Land .................... 12
  - Misconstrued Meaning and Misplaced Moral Imperatives ....................... 14
  - Where the Method is Meaningful, We’re Obligated to Get it Right .......... 15

**Chapter Three - How To’s** ................................................................. 17
  - Starting with Generic and Abstract Playing Fields ............................. 17
  - The Power of Cumulative Probability ................................................. 18
  - Symbolic Conventions for Trees ....................................................... 23
  - Encouragement for the Tentative ..................................................... 27
  - Playing Games On Trees ................................................................. 28
  - Abstractions of Risk Tolerance, Avoidance and Emotion are Real ............ 35
  - Moving to Real Fake Cases ............................................................. 36
  - Percentages’ Protection against Under or Over Inclusive Possibilities ....... 37
  - Robust Structure With A Simple Approach ........................................ 38
  - Closer to Reality ................................................................................. 41
Balanced Trees on Balance Beams ........................................ 41
Avoid a Natural Mistake of The Methodical .......................... 43
The Natural and Optimal Order of Things ............................. 45
A Question of Clarity .............................................................. 47
Final Words on the How To’s and When ................................. 49

Chapter Four - Rigor Requires Refinement ......................... 51
A Mistaken, Inaccurate Map Leads us to Unintended Places .... 51
Structural Over-Simplification and Its Dangers ...................... 51

Chapter Five - Decision Rules When Deciding How Much to Build Out .............. 63
Damages, More Complexity, More Branches, and More Arithmetic ........ 64
Branches Prompt Dialogue and Rigor ................................... 67
Consider the Jury Verdict Form’s Impact .............................. 68
Apply Gut Sense and Reality to Cumulative Probabilities ............ 68
Disavow Distortion Disguised as Greater Diligence .................. 70
Choosing to Walk it Back: Resolving Realism, Complexity, and Confusion ...... 71
For the Practical Arborist, Guidelines to Go By ....................... 74
Strategies for Both - Simpler Presentation & Complex Support Structures ...... 77
Proffering the Probability Subtree ....................................... 77
Damages without Details ..................................................... 78
Separate Confusion of Counterclaims .................................... 82

Chapter Six - Structure Through to the Net (Outcomes) .............. 87
Within Range of Significant Net ........................................... 88
Shortcuts Risk Shorting Communication Value ....................... 92
Anticipate Occasional Resistance ....................................... 94
The Rule Against Sunk Costs, in Perpetuity ........................................... 95

CHAPTER SEVEN - REALITY OF QUANTIFICATION FOR INTANGIBLES....................... 97

Direct Time as an Easy Monetizer .......................................................... 97
Monetizing Financial Impact, Beyond the Hourly .................................. 98
Monetizing Linked Business Impact ....................................................... 99
Monetized Results Straight to Payoffs, or As Close as You Can Get .......... 106
Can’t We Just Talk About it? ................................................................. 108

CHAPTER EIGHT - EVEN MORE INTANGIBLE NON-MONETARY
& IMPORTANT CONSEQUENCES ......................................................... 111

About Risk, the Ever Present and Entirely Real Intangible .................... 116

CHAPTER NINE - PSYCHOLOGY’S IMPORTANT INTERLUDE PERNICIOUS IMPACT
ON SUBJECTIVE PROBABILITY AND PAYOFF PREDICTIONS ..................... 119

Reckoning with the Psyche’s Impediments to Sound Prediction .......... 119
Egocentric and Partisan Perception Biases ............................................ 120
Entrenchment by Judgmental Over-Confidence .................................. 121
The Lawyer’s (or Client’s) Partisan Position ....................................... 121
A Plethora of Research Shows Partisan Perception Bias ...................... 121
The Bias Blind Spot ............................................................................ 122
Judgmental Anchoring ....................................................................... 123
Anchoring, Adjustment, and Underestimating Damages ...................... 124
Evidence of Defense Blind Spot and Underestimation ....................... 124
On Exposure and Wider Range ......................................................... 125
Elicitation for the Full Possible Range ............................................... 127
Value of Risk and Frames .................................................................. 129
The Representativeness Heuristic Distorts Reality ............................... 132
Explanation of Bayesian Bedrock as Back-Up for Prescriptive Advice ........... 133
Promise, Power, and Practice in Probabilities and Payoffs. .................. 135

CHAPTER TEN - AFFIRMING AND WORKING WITH SUBJECTIVE PROBABILITIES. .... 137
On the Virtues of Clarity Over Covert Operations ......................... 138
Disclaiming Precision, Owning Gut Uncertainty ......................... 141
Showing What If?
Sensitivity Analysis Maps the Impact of Uncertainty Ranges .............. 144
A Plug for Comparing Uncertain Choices to Make Decisions in the Trees .... 147

CHAPTER ELEVEN - BEST PRACTICES FOR PROBABILITIES AND PREDICTIONS .... 151
Probability Percentages .................................................. 152
Location, Location, Location - Take Note of Where This Branch Is ......... 152
Affirming the Bedrock of Probability Theory .......................... 155
A Note on Round Numbers .............................................. 156
Prescriptions for Best Practices Premised in Psychology ................. 157
And/Or, With the Opposite First ....................................... 157
Avoiding Biased Anchors and the Representativeness Heuristic .......... 160
Elaboration and Ode to Probability Base Rates - Even if Elusive .......... 161
Data Sources for Deriving Base Rates .................................. 162
Caveat and Advice for Using LexisNexis Verdict and Settlement Analyzer .... 165
Prescriptions in Practice, First With and Then Beyond Base Rate Advice .... 166
Challenges of Choosing or Deriving the Base Rate ....................... 167
Squaring Statistics With Sensible Simplification and Slimmer Trees ........ 168
Finding Probabilities in Vagary:
Deconstructing Present and Future Uncertainties .................... 170
Two Final Comments for the Astute and the Strongly Tree-Inclined ........... 173

CHAPTER TWELVE - END GAME: ESTIMATING NUMBERS AT THE FAR RIGHT ........... 175

Avoiding Mistakes by Accounting for Psychology (Again) ....................... 176
Discrete Questions or Default to High, Medium, and Low ....................... 176
For the Critical Reader, Branches vs. Estimates and Ranges ................... 177
The Right Math for Continuous Ranges ................................................. 180
Math Matters Where The Number isn’t the Answer ............................... 185
From Abstraction to Application ............................................................. 188
From the Simplest Three to Five Point Brackets or More ....................... 189
Data is Theoretically Good and Practically Challenging ......................... 191
Being Wrong ..................................................................................... 192
Refinement by the Factor of Time Value ................................................. 193
Congratulations! ................................................................................ 195

CHAPTER THIRTEEN - CENTERED COMMUNICATION WITH PICTURES, GRACE, AND RIGOR ................................................................. 197

All about the Map, Painted Without Numbers ......................................... 197
Grit and Grace in the Face of Bad News ................................................ 197
A Place to Offer the Lead or Piggyback Part Way ..................................... 198
There It Is; and It’s In There ................................................................ 199
Subtle, Strong, and Welcome Powers .................................................... 200
Reality as Seeable, Touchable, and Evolving ......................................... 201
Finally, The End of All Branches ............................................................ 201

LINKS TO VIDEO INSERTS IN CHAPTER THREE ON “HOW TO’S” .......................... 203

ABOUT ORIGINS, SOURCES, AND REFERENCES .......................... 205